CHANGE WITH AGE IN SUSCEPTIBILITY TO MINOR RESPIRATORY ILLNESS

JEAN DOWNES¹

NE of the striking epidemiological characteristics of the minor respiratory illnesses is the variation of their incidence with age. The attack rate is highest during the early years of life, declines throughout the school ages and until adult life is reached. Then the incidence maintains a fairly constant level. This characteristic, variation in incidence with age, has been noted in all morbidity studies which have

1

Table 1. Mean number of respiratory illnesses per person in each of the three successive years of observation among persons at specific ages, Pleasant-ville and Mt. Kisco combined.¹

		YEAR OF OBSERVATION					
Age as	Number	First: 1946–1947		Second: 1947–1948		Third: 1948-1949	
of First Year	of Persons n	Mean Number of Respiratory Illnesses	Standard Deviation	Mean Number of Respiratory Illnesses	Standard Deviation	Mean Number of Respiratory Illnesses	Standard Deviation
5 Years	79	3.08 ± 0.23	2.02	2.64 ± 0.19	1.67	2.18 ± 0.19	1.69
6	90	2.79 ± 0.20	1.88	2.28 ± 0.19	1.77	2.17 ± 0.20	1.86
7	80	2.39 ± 0.18	1.61	2.20 ± 0.18	1.61	1.74 ± 0.17	1.49
8	104	2.28 ± 0.15	1.58	1.80 ± 0.13	1.34	1.88 ± 0.16	1.63
9	70	1.93 ± 0.19	1.56	1.77 ± 0.19	1.63	1.67 ± 0.20	1.64
10	75	1.76 ± 0.19	1.65	1.48 ± 0.16	1.35	1.65 ± 0.16	1.38
11	80	1.80 ± 0.15	1.38	1.40 ± 0.16	1.48	1.61 ± 0.17	1.54
12	70	1.53 ± 0.16	1.36	1.64 ± 0.18	1.51	1.51 ± 0.18	1.54
13	77	1.79 ± 0.17	1.49	1.26 ± 0.14	1.24	1.42 ± 0.16	1.44
14	75	1.71 ± 0.16	1.41	1.63 ± 0.17	1.47	1.85 ± 0.18	1.52
15	93	1.40 ± 0.13	1.29	1.24 ± 0.14	1.37	1.13 ± 0.12	1.11
16	33	1.70 ± 0.28	1.60	1.45 ± 0.24	1.40	1.21 ± 0.18	1.01
17	38	0.97 ± 0.18	1.12	1.05 ± 0.20	1.24	0.74 ± 0.15	0.91
18	26	1.15 ± 0.27	1.38	1.00 ± 0.21	1.07	0.77 ± 0.25	1.28
19-29	87	1.28 ± 0.13	1.24	1.14 ± 0.13	1.20	1.14 ± 0.15	1.43
30-34	164	1.21±0.09	1.09	1.17 ± 0.08	1.05	1.27 ± 0.09	1.16
35-39	291	1.22 ± 0.07	1.19	1.14 ± 0.07	1.17	1.21 ± 0.07	1.24
4044	281	1.09 ± 0.07	1.17	0.94±0.07	1.13	0.98 ± 0.07	1.10
45-49	179	0.87±0.07	0.92	0.85 ± 0.07	0.90	0.67±0.07	0.91
50+	104	0.84±0.09	0.93	0.77±0.10	0.98	0.56±0.08	0.78

¹School years: September, 1946-May, 1947; September, 1947-May, 1948; and September, 1948-May, 1949.

¹From the Milbank Memorial Fund. This is the sixth in a series of papers dealing with a study of acute respiratory illness.

included records of the common cold and other minor respiratory illnesses (1, 2, 3, 4).

It seems quite logical to assume that the variation of incidence of respiratory illness with age is due for the most part to change in the susceptibility of the host to the organism or organisms responsible for such illness. Degree of contact with the community appears to be a factor whch may have an influence upon change in susceptibility of the host. For example, preschool children have the highest attack rate from respiratory illness but they have considerably less contact with the community than do school-age children or adults. As the environment becomes broader with corresponding greater opportunities for contact with respiratory illness, the incidence of



Susceptibility to Minor Respiratory Illness

such illness declines. On the other hand decline in susceptibility to these diseases may be due also to physiological change in the host which accompanies growth and physical development.

A three-year study of acute respiratory illness in two communities, Pleasantville and Mt. Kisco in Westchester County, New York, provides data which make it possible to describe in detail change or lack of change in susceptibility to minor respiratory illnesses. The purpose of this report is to present these data.

DATA AND METHOD OF STUDY

The data and method of the study of respiratory illness in the two communities in Westchester County, New York, have been fully described in previous reports (5, 6, 7). Briefly, the

Source of Variation	Degrees of Freedom	Variation or Sum of Squared Deviations	Variance (Mean Square)	Ratio of Variance	P•		
	5 YEARS						
Between Year Means Among Person Means Residual Total	2 78 156	31.92 527.06 248.08 807.06	15.96 6.76 1.59	10.04 4.25	<.01 <.01		
	6 years						
Between Year Means Among Person Means Residual Total	2 89 178	19.82 659.37 254.18 933.37	9.91 7.41 1.43	6.93 5.18	<.01 <.01		
	7 years						
Between Year Means Among Person Means Residual Total	2 79 158	17.91 391.18 204.09 613.18	8.96 4.95 1.29	6.95 3.84	<.01 <.01		
	8 YEARS						
Between Year Means Among Person Means Residual Total	2 103 206	13.66 463.95 258.34 735.95	6.83 4.50 1.25	5.46 3.60	<.01 <.01		

Table 2. Variance in minor respiratory illness among persons at age of first observation. (Three years of observation.) Pleasantville and Mt. Kisco combined. September, 1946–May, 1949.

Source of Variation	Degrees of Freedom	VARIATION OR SUM OF SQUARED DEVIATIONS	Variance (Mean Square)	Ratio of Variance	P•				
	9 YEARS								
Between Year Means	2	2.35	1.18						
Among Person Means	69	380.11	5.51	4.63	<.01				
Total	138	546.78	1.19						
	10 YEARS								
Between Year Means	2	1 24	> 05						
Among Person Means	74	302.38	4.09	3.38	<.01				
Residual	148	179.00	1.21						
Total		484.38							
		11 v	EARS						
Between Year Means	2	6.41	3.21	3.38	.01 —. 05				
Among Person Means	79	367.40	4.65	4.89	<.01				
Residual	158	149.59	0.95						
LOLAI	523.40								
	12 YEARS								
Between Year Means	2	0.70	0.35						
Among Person Means	69	299.03	4.33	3.87	<.01				
Residual	138	153.97	1.12						
Total		453.70							
	13 YEARS								
Between Year Means	2	11.54	5.77	4.93	<.01				
Among Person Means	76	273.06	3.59	3.07	<.01				
Residual	152	177.12	1.17						
Total		401.72			<u> </u>				
	14 YEARS								
Between Year Means	2	1.98	0.99						
Among Person Means	74	334.46	4.52	4.39	<.01				
Residual Total	148	152.02 488.46	1.03						
	15 YEARS								
Between Year Means	2	3.41	1.71	1.73	∠.05				
Among Person Means Residual	92	202.93	2.80	2.07	< .01				
Total	101	448.93	0.77						
	16 years								
Retween Year Means	2	3 88	1.94	1.90	>.05				
Among Person Means	32	117.21	3.66	3.59	<.01				
Residual	64	65.45	1.02						
Total	1	186.54							

Degrees of Freedom	Variation or Sum of Squared Deviations	ation or Sum Variance Ratio of (Mean of ed Deviations Square) Variance		P*				
17 YEARS								
2 37 74	2.05 84.96 51.28 138.29	1.03 2.30 0.69	1.49 3.33	>.05 <.01				
18 YEARS								
2 25 50	1.95 69.28 52.72 123.95	0.98 2.77 1.05	2.64	<.01				
19–29 YEARS								
2 86 172	1.02 305.80 132.98 439.80	0.51 3.56 0.77	4.62	<.01				
30-34 YEARS								
2 163 326	0.78 337.06 257.89 595.73	0.39 2.07 0.79	2.62	<.01				
35-39 YEARS								
2 290 580	1.14 765.72 490.19 1,257.05	0.57 2.64 0.85	3.11	<.01				
40-44 YEARS								
2 280 560	3.21 689.67 392.12 1,085.00	1.61 2.46 0.70	2.30 3.51	>.05 <.01				
45-49 years								
2 178 356	4.32 245.54 199.02 448.88	2.16 1.38 0.56	3.86 2.46	.01—.05 <.01				
50+ years								
2 103 206	4.40 157.41 96.93	2.20 1.53 0.47	4.68 3.26	.01 —.05 <.01				
	DEGREES OF FREEDOM 2 37 74 2 25 50 2 25 50 2 286 172 2 163 326 2 290 580 2 290 580 2 280 560 2 2178 356 2 178 356	$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $	$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $	DEGREES OF FREEDOM VARIATION OR SUM OF SQUARED DEVIATIONS VARIANCE (MEAN SQUARE) RATIO OF VARIANCE 17 YEARS 17 YEARS 2 2.05 37 1.03 84.96 2.30 74 1.49 3.33 74 51.28 1.28 0.69 3.33 74 51.28 138.29 0.98 2.5 69.28 50 2.77 1.05 2.64 19-29 YEARS 19-29 YEARS 4.62 4.62 172 132.98 305.80 305.80 326 0.39 2.62 2.62 30-34 YEARS 30-34 YEARS 4.62 172 132.98 0.79 0.79 2.62 2.62 326 257.89 2.57.39 0.79 2.62 3.11 40-44 YEARS 40-44 YEARS 3.11 2 1.14 0.57 2.26 0.70 3.51 3.11 2 3.21 0.70 1.61 2.30 3.51 2.30 3.51 2 3.21 0.70 2.64 3.51 3.51 2 3.21 0.70 2.64 3.51 3.51 2 3.21 0.70 2.46 3.51 3.51 2 3.21 0.70 3.66 3.51				

Table 2.—(Continued)

* P Gives the probability with which differences equal to or exceeding those observed might arise through chance.

epidemiological field investigation of respiratory illness was based upon the periodic survey of families for the purpose of collection of illness records. All families in which there were one or more children attending grade school or high school in each of the two communities were included in the study. These families were visited every twenty-eight days during the three school years, September to June, 1946–1949. On each visit to the family, inquiry was made about acute respiratory illnesses which had occurred among their members during the past four weeks.

Acute respiratory illness presented in this report includes all reported illnesses except attacks of asthma, intestinal influenza or grippe, tonsillectomies, and mastoidectomies. Previous analyses have shown that the two communities were similar with respect to age distribution of the study population and median size of family. However, there was a definite difference between the two with respect to education and occupational class of the head of the household. For the purposes of this particular analysis it is believed that any differences between the two communities can be ignored. Therefore, the data presented represent the combined experience of both.

This is a study based upon 564 families, all of which were observed for illness in each of the three school years. A further restriction upon the data was imposed. Only families described as simple biological units are included. These units were composed of a husband, wife, and their children.² This results in a homogeneous group in which the risk of exposure within the family and of community exposure to respiratory disease may be considered to be held relatively constant. It is true that husbands, wives, and children may all have different opportunities for community exposure to respiratory illness. However, the families because of their constitution are generally similar in this respect.

STABILITY OF RESISTANCE TO RESPIRATORY ILLNESS

The study of either susceptibility or resistance to respiratory

² In thirty-six families there was only one parent present, that is, the parent was a widow or a widower.

illness requires data of a particular kind. Records of such illness must be collected with great care for the same persons over a period of time. Care is needed in the collection of these records to insure that any differences in number of illnesses in time are not due to some variation in the method of obtaining reports of such illness, or due to variations caused by unusual epidemics of respiratory disease. Consequently, very few studies of respiratory illness can meet the rigorous standards for critical study of host susceptibility or resistance.

Gafafer and Doull had data which met the requirements for study of resistance to the common cold (8). Their study included a number of groups. The ones cited here are one student group numbering 111 who reported their respiratory illnesses for three years and forty-five who reported for four years. Their conclusion concerning the study of the two stu-

Age	Number of Persons N	1st Versus 2nd Year		2nd Versus 3rd Year		1st Versus 3rd Year	
as of First Year		Correlation Coefficient r	Standard Error ør	Correlation Coefficient r	Standard Error or	Correlation Coefficient r	Standard Error σr
5 Years 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	79 90 80 104 70 75 80 70 77 75	.53 .66 .61 .47 .55 .47 .53 .50 .47 .44	.081 .059 .071 .084 .091 .081 .091 .089 .090	.50 .60 .43 .47 .59 .42 .64 .41 .45 .59	.085 .067 .092 .077 .079 .096 .066 .099 .092 .076	.54 .49 .41 .51 .53 .53 .57 .34 .53	.080 .081 .094 .076 .090 .092 .081 .081 .102 .083
15 16 17 18 19-29 30-34 35-39 40-44 45-49 50+	93 33 26 87 164 291 281 1 79 104	.43 .43 .56 .52 .53 .30 .43 .45 .44 .48	.085 .145 .113 .146 .077 .071 .048 .048 .048 .060 .075	.42 .66 .34 .50 .60 .41 .49 .52 .32 .39	.086 .099 .145 .149 .069 .065 .045 .043 .067 .083	. 32 . 41 . 41 . 51 . 34 . 33 . 41 . 23 . 42	.094 .146 .137 .198 .077 .069 .052 .050 .071 .081

Table 3. Correlation coefficients for minor respiratory illnesses among persons of both sexes by single years of age and broad age groups for adults. Pleasantville and Mt. Kisco combined. School years September, 1946–May, 1947; September, 1947–May, 1948; September, 1948–May, 1949.

dent groups was "that stability of resistance or susceptibility to colds was not a characteristic of either population."

In the present analysis it is postulated that susceptibility

to minor respiratory illness changes with age. To test this assumption it is necessarv to study the illness experience over a period of years of persons in well-defined or narrow age classes until adult life is reached. Consequently, the data are presented for children by single years of age, starting at age 5 and up to age 18, and thereafter for adults by broad age groups. It seems reasonable to assume that children at specific ages have generally similar risks of exposure to respiratory illness in the community and that adults, whose environment is not so circumscribed as that of chil-



dren, have among themselves similar opportunities of contact with respiratory illness.

Table 1 shows the mean number of respiratory illnesses per person in three successive years of observation for persons at specific ages. The data are arrayed according to age as of the first year. For example, the mean number of illnesses for those who were age 5 in the first year was 3.08 per person; in the second year when they were age 6 the mean was 2.64; and in the third year when they had reached age 7, the mean was 2.18.



Fig. 2, A, B, and C. Scatter diagram showing the relationship between the number of respiratory illnesses observed in children aged 6 in successive school years: A, 1946-1947 and 1947-1948; B, 1947-1948 and 1948-1949; and C, with an interval of one year, 1946-1947 and 1948-1949.

The decline in incidence of respiratory illness with age can be seen most clearly in Figure 1 which shows the mean number of attacks per person at specific ages in each of the three successive school years. After age 5 there was a rapid decline in the mean incidence per person until age 12. During the adolescent ages there was increase, though an somewhat irregular, in the mean number of illnesses per person.

During the late teeen ages there was a fairly sharp decrease in the incidence of respiratory illness. After adult life was reached the mean number of illnesses per person maintained a fairly constant level, about 1 to 1.2 per person; after age 40 there was a slight decline in the mean number of illnesses.

A point of considerable interest brought out by Figure 1 is that the period of adolescence, a period of physiological change or stress, shows an increase in susceptibility to respiratory illness. This may be interpreted to mean that susceptibility to infection is not determined solely by familiarity of the host with infecting organisms in the environment which results in an increase in resistance, or natural immunity. Change in the internal environment of the host is also a factor of importance.

The decline in incidence of respiratory illness with age is due

l

ß

no doubt to a decline in susceptibility to such illness as age increases. It is a striking fact that the decline is most rapid during the period of deceleration of growth; at the adolescent

ages it is halted and the incidence shows some increase during this period of acceleration of growth. When full maturity is reached the incidence tends to maintain a level with no marked fluctuations.

Figure 1 also illustrates the fact that there was essentially no real difference between the years studied, that is, no evidence of unusual epidemics of respiratory illness in one year as compared with another. Therefore, the data are entirely suitable for comparison of a person's experience of respiratory illness in the three successive vears.



A comparison of a person's experience in the three successive years may be examined by application of the method of analysis of variance to the data. Table 2 shows these data. Here again the data are arrayed according to single years of age at first observation, from age 5 to age 18 and by broad age groups thereafter. It is noteworthy that up to age 9 there is a signifi-

cant variation between years and after that age, with a few exceptions, the variation between years is not significant until age 45 is reached. This again is evidence that young children



Fig. 3, A, B, and C. Scatter diagram showing the relationship between the number of respiratory illnesses observed in children aged 10 in successive school years: A, 1946-1947 and 1947-1948; B, 1947-1948 and 1948-1949; and C, with an interval of one year, 1946-1947 and 1948-1949.

ness class over a period such as three years.

A comparison of the illness experience of the same persons at different periods of time may also be made by use of the coefficient of correlation, the Pearsonian product moment r. Table 3 shows the computed correlation coefficients for the experience in pairs of years; the first year versus the second; the second versus the third; and the first versus the second; the second versus the third; and the first versus the third year. Except for persons aged 18, in each period of time the coefficient of correlation is highly significant. There was a definite tendency for persons to remain in the same sickness class, that is, to remain high or low, over a period of time, such as three years. However, in general, the positive association was less marked between the first and the third years than between the pairs of successive years.

of school age are changing their illness pattern. They are in the process of developing resistance to respiratory illness or are adjusting to their environment in that respect.

In each age group there is a significant ratio of variance for the individual mean attack rate for the three-year period. In other words, certain persons remain susceptible and tend to fall into the same illFigures 2, 3, and 4 show scatter diagrams with regression lines for persons at three different ages: children aged 6, children aged 10, and adults aged 30-34. The coefficient of correla-

tion was highest for those aged 6, somewhat lower for children aged 10, and lowest for adults aged 30-34.

It seems reasonable to conclude from these data that stability of resistance or change in susceptibility to respiratory illness is different for young children compared with adults. During the early school ages, resistance to respiratory illness is in the process of being established. When adult life is reached there is a tendency for persons who suffer frequent attacks of respiratory illness to remain over a period of time in that class.



Acknowledgments are made to Dr. Mildred Wells and to the Westchester County Department of Health for generous assistance and cooperation which greatly facilitated the study of acute respiratory illness.

An especial acknowledgment is made to the families in Pleasantville and Mt. Kisco who participated in the study.

References

1. Sydenstricker, Edgar: Sex Differences in the Incidence of Certain Diseases at Different Ages. Hagerstown Morbidity Studies No. 1X. Public Health Reports, May 25, 1928, 43, No. 21, pp. 1259–1276.

2. Van Volkenburgh, V. A. and Frost, W. H.: Acute Minor Respiratory Diseases Prevailing in a Group of Families Residing in Baltimore, Maryland, 1928-1930.



Fig. 4, A, B, and C. Scatter diagram showing the relationship between the number of respiratory illnesses observed in adults aged 30-34 in successive school years: A, 1946-1947 and 1947-1948; B, 1947-1948 and 1948-1949; and C, with an interval of one year, 1946-1947 and 1948-1949. Prevalence, Distribution and Clinical Description of Observed Cases. The American Journal of Hygiene, January, 1933, xvii, No. 1, pp. 122–153.

3. Collins Selwyn D.: The Incidence of Illness and the Volume of Medical Services Among 9,000 Canvassed Families. Cases and Days of Illness Among Males and Females, with Special Reference to Confinement to Bed. *Public Health Reports*, January 12, 1940, 55, No. 2, pp. 47-93.

4. Tucher Doris; Coulter, Jane E.; and Downes, Jean: Incidence of Acute Respiratory Illness Among Males and Females at Specific Ages. The Milbank Memorial Fund *Quarterly*, January, 1952, xxx, No. 1, pp. 42-60.

5. Downes, Jean: Control of Acute Respiratory Illness by Ultra-Violet Lights. American Journal of Public Health, December, 1950, 40, No. 12, pp. 1512–1520.

6. Downes, Jean: The Control of Acute Respiratory Illness by Ultra-Violet Lights. The Milbank Memorial Fund *Quarterly*, April, 1951, XXIX, No. 2, pp. 186–217.

7. Downes, Jean: Seasonal Differences in Character of the "Common Cold" Observed in Two Communities in Westchester County, New York. The Milbank Memorial Fund *Quarterly*, January, 1952, xxx, No. 1, pp. 18-41.

8. Gafafer, William M. and Doull, James A.: Stability of Resistance to the Common Cold. The American Journal of Hygiene, November, 1933, xviii, No. 3, pp. 712-726.